

CITY OF BATAVIA

DATE: April 2, 2019
TO: Committee of the Whole - City Services 4/9/19
FROM: Timothy Grimm, P.E. – Senior Civil Engineer
SUBJECT: **Resolution 19-33-R - Authorizing Execution of the Contract with Performance Construction & Engineering, LLC for the 2019 Ward 1 Storm Sewer Reconstruction – Phase 2 for an amount not-to-exceed \$1,443,712.60.**

Resolution 19-34-R - Authorizing execution of Task Order #3 for Construction Engineering with Baxter & Woodman, Inc. for an amount not-to-exceed \$108,645.00.

Summary

The Engineering Division opened bids for the 2019 Ward 1 Storm Sewer Reconstruction construction project on Thursday, March 14, 2019.

The project includes construction of large diameter storm sewer, precast box culverts, watermain replacement, concrete curb and gutter, sidewalk, and restoration among other items. The expected completion date for this project is August 30, 2019.

Project History

In 2016, the City of Batavia allocated funds to complete a thorough drainage study of the 1st Ward on the east side due to repeated flooding events occurring in this area. The area of concern is generally bound by Pine Street to the north, Raddant Road to the west, Giese Road to the south and Kirk Road to the east. During the June 15, 2015 rain event this area experienced stormwater back-ups that have not been seen in the past. There was water filling numerous streets within this neighborhood, sometimes backing up into yards and an occasional house.

The preliminary engineering study was completed in 2016 and included a full investigation and analysis on the storm sewer system in this area including the routing, sizing, any locations of restrictions and hydraulic capacity of the storm sewer system including the culvert located under the Kirk Road, where the system ultimately discharges to a channel. The results of the study recommend replacement and upsizing of the existing storm sewer in several locations throughout the study area.

The overall project final engineering was completed by WBK in 2018 and includes plans and specifications for the construction of the new storm sewers within the project limits. Due to the large size of the project construction will take over a four period. The first stage of work was completed in 2018 and included storm sewer construction from the outfall south of Kirk and then west along Giese stopping at the intersection of Larkspur Lane and Giese Road. In addition to the new storm sewer, watermain was replaced due to the age of the pipe and history of frequent breaks in this area.



Construction

For 2019, the construction will include primarily 48-in to 54-in diameter storm sewer replacement along Larkspur Ln, from Giese north to Chillem. The new storm sewer will continue west along Chillem Dr to Bluestem Ln and then north stopping at Lexington.

Due to the large size of the project and the need for staging of equipment and materials, roads in the construction zones will be closed to thru traffic.

In addition to the storm sewer work, 8-in diameter watermain and water services will also be installed within the limits of the construction.

The remaining improvements will be constructed on Chillem Dr, Cardinal Ct, Orchard Ct, Bluestem Ln, and Rye Ct in the following years through 2021.

A bid alternate was also added in the bid package which included a complete HMA milling and resurfacing of the work area for 2019 Phase 2. Alternate Bid #1 includes a HMA patch to within 2-in of final surface above the trench excavation. Once the utilities have been installed the entire limits of the work area (Larkspur Lane, Chillem, Bluestem) will be resurfaced with 2-in of asphalt.

2019 Ward 1 Storm Sewer Reconstruction – Bidding Results:

Bidder	Base Bid Amount	Base Bid + Alt Bid 1 Amount
Performance Construction	\$1,257,770.00	\$1,312,466.00
Pirtano Construction	\$1,287,000.00	\$1,337,945.00
V3 Construction	\$1,347,000.00	\$1,398,335.00
Cecchin Plumbing	\$1,417,642.00	\$1,472,642.00
Archon Construction	\$1,451,261.00	\$1,521,161.00
Bolder Contractors	\$1,512,799.00	\$1,565,633.00
Martam Construction	\$1,588,842.00	\$1,667,085.00
Copenhaver Construction	\$1,600,161.02	\$1,671,707.02
Swallow Construction	\$1,675,454.75	\$1,721,422.25

Nine bids were received from contractors and three of those bids were within about 10% of the low base bid which generally indicates good overall pricing. Also, the low bid was less than the engineers estimate. The alternate bid amount was about \$54,700 and includes about 5,050 square yards of hot mix asphalt resurfacing of the entire work area, 2-in depth. This is a good price and is recommended to include for contract award.



Due to the nature of the project and potential for conflicts with existing utilities and other unforeseen conditions we are awarding the contract with an additional 10% contingency to allow for change orders, awarding a total of \$1,443,712.60 (Base Bid & Alternate Bid 1 plus 10%) to Performance Construction and Engineering. Performance Construction was the contractor for Phase 1 work in 2018 and completed the project according to specifications and performed very well with few issues.

Construction Engineering Services

Six consulting firms submitted statements of qualifications and sealed cost proposals for this project. The submittals were due on Friday, March 8, 2019. Staff reviewed and discussed the revised statement of qualifications, individually updated scores and ranked the submittals, combined scores for an average score, and then opened the sealed cost proposals. The consultant’s average scores based on qualifications were then converted to a decimal (89% becomes .89) and proposed cost was divided by the consultant’s score to arrive at an “adjusted cost.” The consultant with the lowest “adjusted cost” is recommended for award. The consultant with the lowest adjusted cost and being recommended for this project is Baxter & Woodman, Inc from Crystal Lake.

Below is a summary of the consultant rankings that were solicited for qualifications and the cost proposal:

Consultant	Rank Based on Qualifications *	Rank Based on Cost Proposal **	Rank Based on Both Qualifications & Cost ***
Baxter & Woodman	1	1	1
V3	2	6	4
ESI Consultants	3	4	3
ERA Consultants	4	2	2
Thomas Engineering	5	5	6
Trotter & Associates	6	3	5

* 1 indicates best qualified and 6 indicates least qualified
 ** 1 indicates lowest proposal cost and 6 indicates highest proposal cost
 *** 1 indicates best desirable consultant based on both qualifications and cost and 6 indicates least desirable consultant based on both qualifications and cost

The City had selected Baxter & Woodman as the consultant to perform construction engineering services on the 2018 Ward 1 storm sewer project. Baxter & Woodman performed very well on this project last year and are very familiar with the project and well prepared to handle the oversight on the 2019 Phase 2 construction. Based on the experience of their project team and overall work history staff feels that they are very well qualified for this project.



Funding Breakdown

Below is the breakdown of funding source for this project:

Funding Source	Budget	Bid Amount	(Shortfall/) Savings	Bid Amount +10% Contingency
<i>Construction – Base Bid:</i> Drainage Capital Projects (32-34- 6470) Water Improvements (30-71-6476)	\$1,368,624.00	\$1,257,770.00	\$110,854.00	\$1,383,547.00 *
<i>Construction – Alt Bid #1:</i> Street Maintenance (43-47-6471)	\$54,696.00	\$54,696.00	\$0.00	\$60,165.60 *
<i>Construction Engineering:</i> Drainage Capital Projects (32-34- 6470) Water Improvements (30-71-6476)	\$95,835.00	\$108,645.00	(\$12,810.00)	\$108,645.00
Total	\$1,519,155.00	\$1,421,111.00	\$98,044.00	\$1,552,357.60

*The amounts where indicated include a 10% contingency to the Base bid and Alt #1 amount that was bid.

Alternate Bid #1 includes only the streets resurfacing work and therefore the construction will be paid thru the Streets Maintenance budget funding code as shown. The overall amounts for the Alt #1 bid for construction and construction engineering amounts are below the amount allotted for Ward 1 2019. However, we will be over budget should we need to use the full amount of 10% contingency as shown. We have seen savings in other drainage projects (e.g. Mahoney Creek Streambank Stabilization) that we have bid recently. Should we need to use the contingency amount we expect that the budget shortfall will be offset by these other stormwater related projects. Staff believes that the 10% contingency amount will be necessary on this project to account for any unforeseen conditions due to the size and nature of the work.

Recommended Action:

Staff recommends for the City Services Committee approve the following:

1. The construction Contract for the 2019 Ward 1 Storm Reconstruction – Phase 2 with Performance Construction & Engineering, LLC. in the amount not-to-exceed \$1,443,712.60 and Resolution 19-33-R.
2. Authorizing execution of Task Order #3 for Construction Engineering Services with Baxter & Woodman, Inc. in the amount not-to-exceed \$108,645.00 and Resolution 19-34-R.