

**MINUTES**  
**September 10, 2018**  
**Historic Preservation Commission**  
**City of Batavia**

Please **NOTE:** These minutes are not a word-for-word transcription of the statements made at the meeting, nor intended to be a comprehensive review of all discussions. They are intended to make an official record of the actions taken by the Committee/City Council, and to include some description of discussion points as understood by the minute-taker. They may not reference some of the individual attendee's comments, nor the complete comments if referenced.

**1. Meeting Called to Order**

Vice-Chair Roller called the meeting to order at 5:32pm.

**2. Roll Call**

**Members Present:** Vice-Chair Roller; Commissioners Hohmann, Sullivan (entered at 5:41pm), Sherer, and Bus

**Members Absent:** Chair Hagemann

**Also Present:** Jeff Albertson, Building Commissioner; Jennifer Austin-Smith, Recording Secretary

**3. Approval of Minutes:**

- July 23, 2018
- August 20, 2018
- August 27, 2018

**Motion:** To approve the minutes from July 23, 2018; August 20, 2018; and August 27, 2018

**Maker:** Bus

**Second:** Sherer

**Voice Vote:** 4 Ayes, 0 Nays, 2 Absent  
Motion carried.

**4. Items to be Removed, Added or Changed**

Vice-Chair Roller stated that for the interest of time for the applicants the agenda would be changed to discuss the COA on 5 North River Street prior to the COA on 107 East Wilson Street. There was no objection by the Commissioners and the agenda was adjusted.

**5. Matters From the Public (for items not on the agenda)**

There were no members from the public to address the Commission.

**6. COA Review: 5 North River Street  
Roof Replacement (Bagg Exteriors, Applicant)**

Bill Bagg, applicant, addressed the Commission. He stated that he would like to remove and replace the last fourth of the roof with the same type and color shingles on the western addition portion of the building. The shingles would be 25-year shingles.

**Motion:** To approve the COA as presented  
**Maker:** Sherer  
**Second:** Bus  
**Roll Call Vote:** **Aye:** Sherer, Bus, Hohmann, Roller  
**Nay:**  
4-0 Vote, 2 Absent, Motion carried.

**7. COA Review Continuation: 107 East Wilson Street – Façade Changes (Allen& Pepa Architects, applicant)**

Lane Allen, architect and applicant, addressed the Commission. Allen showed the Commission a PowerPoint slide with the rendering of the proposed façade as well as the building as it stands today. Allen stated that the owner prefers backlit lettering instead of the surface mounted lights with the letters face lit. Allen pointed out the adjacent building on the east and how the red brick carries over onto the adjacent building. He stated that in the COA it is written that the red brick would be covered with the Nichiha siding, as shown in the rendering. However, Allen would prefer to cleave the red brick off and expose the adjacent building's original limestone if that is structurally possible. Roller commented that she would prefer to have the original building exposed rather than covering the red brick.

A discussion was held on the Historic Preservation Commission's decision to have the stone columns on the adjacent building from being parged. Bus stated that it was the Commission's decision to have the columns be restored by flaking off the old cement product to expose the limestone. Allen stated that he is of the opinion that the parging is original. He stated that he would have a masonry restoration expert take a look at the columns and report his findings to Jeff Albertson.

The Commission discussed the proportions of the window paneling and the color palette. Allen confirmed that the color palette is the same as presented at the last meeting but the colors do look different on the PowerPoint tonight. Hohmann thanked Allen for the additional time to review this COA. Hohmann stated that the design is a departure but the area this building is located in is eclectic and the changes to this building would be an improvement. Allen stated that the dark palette of this building would help the other buildings to push forward. Roller stated that we are not using any materials that are typical of a Historic District but the color palette would blend well with the stone and she likes that the red brick on the corner would be addressed. She was on the fence and has come around to it. Jeremy, contractor, entered the meeting and Allen informed him of the plan to cleave off the red brick with the intent to make the easterly building more proud. The result might be tuck-pointing rather than covering the brick with Nichiha. Jeremy said the alternative would be fiscally possible and they just need to ensure that it would be structurally possible. Allen noted to Jeremy that he would have the masonry restoration expert inspect the columns on the eastern building. Bus asked Jeremy when they plan on starting. Jeremy answered that the demo permit has been issued and they would like to begin as soon as possible. Bus stated that he would like it entered into the COA that the COA is subject to the preservation of the limestone wall on the adjacent building. If that is not possible the applicant should return to the Commission with an alternative. Allen stated that he is in support of cleaving off the red brick and having the building look the best that he can.

**Motion:** To approve COA with the addition that the red brick be removed and expose the neighboring façade and not use the Nichiha. If that does not work the applicant should return to the Commission to discuss an alternate solution.

**Maker:** Bus

**Second:** Hohmann

**Roll Call Vote:** **Aye:** Bus, Hohmann, Sullivan, Roller, Sherer

**Nay:**

5-0 Vote, 1 Absent, Motion carried.

## **8. Updates:**

- 1. 7 East Wilson Street – Historic Inspection**
- 2. Anderson Block Building – Masonry Maintenance**
- 3. Significant Historic Building Inspection Program**
- 4. 10/12 North River Street – Historic Inspection**
- 5. 227 West Wilson Street – Historic Inspection**
- 6. 129 South Batavia Avenue – Historic Inspection**
- 7. 8 North River Street – Historic Inspection**
- 8. 16 East Wilson Street – Historic Inspection**
- 9. Certified Local Government**

Albertson stated that the Certified Local Government application is being worked on. Albertson stated that there is nothing more to report at this time.

## **9. Other Business**

Albertson announced that at the next Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) meeting there would be discussion on the COA for the 12 West Wilson Street Wall Sign. Albertson stated that the owner of the building would like the Commission to reconsider his first proposal, which was having the sign cover the First National Bank lettering on the building. Since the COA was approved with conditions the owner is unable to appeal the HPC's decision and go before the City Council. Therefore, the procedure is to have the owner present the original COA for HPC's reconsideration.

Albertson noted that the owner does have one other alternative for the Commission to consider, which is having the signage on the corner of the building on each side. The signs would not be sticking out but would be flat signs, one on each corner. Bus stated that he voted no on that prior COA motion because he did not think that was the right way to handle it. You either approve something or deny it; you don't make it subject to because that is not a good way to handle things as a Commission. Bus stated that it would be a shame to cover the First National Bank signage that is historical. Sherer encouraged the HPC to attend the Council meeting if this COA goes before the Council. Bus and Sherer stated they would prefer the corner signage option rather than covering up the historical First National Bank sign. Roller stated that if they do it on the corner on both sides then it would not look as awkward as it did on the other side. Sullivan stated that he does not have a problem with the owner covering up the First National Bank signage because a sign that covers the letters up would not be there forever and when the sign comes down those letters would still be there and would ultimately still be part of the building.

Albertson noted that the sign representative informed him that he does not believe those letters are original to the building. Hohmann stated that he would review a postcard he has of that building from the 1900's. Sherer stated that she would work with the Depot Museum regarding this. Sherer asserted that the building was first the First National Bank and then it was the Board of Education office. She does not know how the lettering could not be original to the building. Albertson stated that he would ask the sign representative to back up their statement.

#### **10. Adjournment**

There being no other business to discuss, Vice-Chair Roller asked for a motion to adjourn the meeting at 6:18pm; Made by Bus; Seconded by Hohmann. Motion carried.

Minutes respectfully submitted by Jennifer Austin-Smith, Recording Secretary, on September 12, 2018.